



---

Joseph R. Kiniry, **Dermot Cochran** and Patrick E. Tierney

Systems Research Group,  
School of Computer Science and Informatics,  
UCD CASL, University College Dublin,  
Belfield, Dublin 4, Ireland

<http://www.ucd.ie/csi>

---

# Verification-Centric Realization of Electronic Vote Counting



# KOA/2 Remote Voting System

The original Kiezen op Afstand (KOA) was part of a remote voting system developed for the Dutch government licensed under the GPL.

KOA/2 is now a platform for research into computer-based voting and is not intended for use in government elections.

In addition to being Open Source, part of KOA/2 is also formally specified and verified.

The Dutch tally system was formally verified using JML and ESC/Java2.

The Irish vote counting system has been specified using JML and typechecked with ESC/Java2.



# EBON specification example

```
class BALLOT
  description
    "A ballot paper in an Irish election."
  query
    "What is the location of this ballot \
    in the current count?"
    "What is the count number for the \
    last transfer of this ballot?"
    "Is this ballot non-transferable?"
    "What is the first preference of this \
    ballot?"
    "To which candidate is this ballot \
    assigned?"
    "What is the next preference \
    candidate?"
    "What is this ballot's ID number?"
    "Is this ballot paper assigned to a \
    given candidate?"
    "How many preferences remain on this \
    ballot?"
    "Is this ballot on top of a given \
    different ballot?"
  command
    "Set this ballot's candidate list."
    "Transfer this ballot to the next \
    preference candidate."
  constraint
    "No two ballots have the same \
    ballot ID."
    "A ballot must be assigned to a \
    candidate that is on its candidate \
    list."
    "No two preferences given to \
    candidates on this ballot may be \
    identical."
    "Preferences expressed on this ballot \
    must start with 1, monotonically \
    increase, and grow no larger than \
    the number of candidates available \
    on this ballot."
    "If this ballot is transferred, the \
    count number at which this ballot \
    was last transferred must be \
    positive."
end
```

# Java Modeling Language (JML)

JML is a formal behavioral specification language for Java.

Annotations embedded in special comments are used to formally express the properties of a Java class/interface.

JML is used for modeling of a system or for detailed software specifications using design-by-contract.

Voting systems that we have formally specified differ from country to country.

The Dutch Voting system is list based  
voters vote for parties, not individuals

Ireland uses Proportional Representation  
with a Single Transferable Vote  
(PRSTV)

*voters rank individuals by preference*



# Irish Vote Counting Specification

39 formal assertions were identified in the Count Rules published by the Irish Government.

Each assertion was expressed in JML and identified and cross-referenced by a Javadoc comment.

A state machine was specified so as to link the assertions together.



# Example of a Legal Requirement

Section 7 item 3.2 on page 25 of the first source document states:

As a first step, a transfer factor is calculated, viz. the number of votes in the surplus is divided by the total number of transferable votes in the last set of votes. This transfer factor is multiplied in turn by the total number of votes in each sub-set of next available preferences for continuing candidates (note that the transfer factor is not applied to the sub-set of non-transferable votes in the set of votes).

The requirement is written in EBON as follows:

The number of votes in the surplus is divided by the total number of transferable votes in the last set of votes. This transfer factor is multiplied in turn by the total number of votes in each subset of next available preferences for continuing candidates.

```
/**
 * Determine actual number of votes to transfer to this candidate, excluding
 * rounding up of fractional transfers
 *
 * @see requirement 25 from section 7 item 3.2 on page 25
 *
 * @design The votes in a surplus are transferred in proportion to
 * the number of transfers available throughout the candidates ballot stack.
 * The calculations are made using integer values because there is no concept
 * of fractional votes or fractional transfer of votes, in the existing manual
 * counting system. If not all transferable votes are accounted for the
 * highest remainders for each continuing candidate need to be examined.
 *
 * @param fromCandidate Candidate from which to count the transfers
 * @param toCandidate Continuing candidate eligible to receive votes
 * @return Number of votes to be transferred, excluding fractional transfers
 */
/*@ ensures \result ==
 * (getSurplus (fromCandidate) *
 * getPotentialTransfers (fromCandidate, toCandidate.getCandidateID()) /
 * getTotalTransferableVotes (fromCandidate)); */
```

```
/**
 * @param fromCandidate An elected or excluded candidate
 * @param toCandidate A continuing candidate
 */
/*@ requires fromCandidate.status() != Candidate.CONTINUING;
 * @ requires toCandidate.status() == Candidate.CONTINUING;
 * @ ensures fromCandidate.getTotalVote() ==
 * @   \old (fromCandidate.getTotalVote() - numberOfVotes);
 * @ ensures toCandidate.getTotalVote() ==
 * @   \old (toCandidate.getTotalVote() + numberOfVotes);
 */
```



# Ballot Paper Shuffling Requirement

All the votes recorded at an election in a constituency must be thoroughly mixed together before counting to ensure that vote transfers on the distribution of a surplus are representative.

The votes within each subset of next available preferences for a particular candidate are sorted in the same relative order as the votes were mixed and numbered before the count began.

The particular votes to be transferred from each subset are the votes with the highest random numbers.

KOA/2 remote voting platform used as a case study for verification centric development.

JML and ESCJava/2 tools used to formally specify two different vote counting systems.

Irish vote counting system was specified prior to implementation.

Others writing e-voting systems can look to our work as an example/case study in how "lightweight reliable software engineering" can work.